# MINUTES BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING,

# THURSDAY, OCTOBER 17, 2013 5:00 P.M. COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL 109 E. OLIVE ST., BLOOMINGTON, ILLINOIS

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Mr. Carson Durham, Mrs. Sherry Graehling, Mr. Dan Greene, Mr. John Elterich,

Mr. Jeff Kennedy, Mr. Julian Westerhout, Mr. Brad Williams

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** None

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Mark Woolard, City Planner

**CALL TO ORDER:** Chairman Durham called the meeting to order at 5:00 P.M.

**ROLL CALL:** Mr. Woolard called the roll.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

Chairman Durham welcomed Mr. Westerhout who is the newest commission

member.

**MINUTES:** The commissioners reviewed the minutes from the September 19, 2013 and October 3, 2013 meetings. On the second page of the September 19, 2013 minutes "Dara" is to change to "Darrah". Mr. Elterich moved to approve the minutes with the correction. Mr. Kennedy seconded the motion, which passed by a vote of 7-0.

#### **REGULAR AGENDA:**

**Case BHP-16-13** Review of application submitted by Christie Lau, requesting an up to \$2500.00 Eugene D. Funk, Jr. Historic Preservation Grant for the gutter and tile roof restoration for the Kirkpatrick House, Craftsman style, 1914, Arthur L. Pillsbury, architect, located at 912 N. Prairie Street in the Franklin Square National Register Historic District.

Chairman Durham introduced the case and invited anyone to speak. Ms. Lau stated the work is now complete. The Commission discussed the project's outcome as they viewed the photos. Ms. Lau expressed satisfaction on work well done as evidenced by her photos. Ms. Lau also stated her opinion of the contactor was one in which she would highly recommend. Questions on standard of care will be addressed by staff prior to payment of the grant.

After due consideration, Mr. Kennedy moved to accept BHP-16-13 Funk grant for the \$2500.00. The motion was seconded by Mrs. Elterich, which passed by a vote of 7-0.

Case BHP-17-13. Review of the application submitted by Victoria Varney requesting an up to \$6,560.00 Harriet Fuller Rust Facade Grant consisting of new awnings for the Snyder Building, 1990, noncontributing, located at 205 N Main Street, in the Downtown Bloomington National Register District.

Chairman Durham introduced the case and invited anyone to speak. Ms. Varney, owner of the building, presented the project as placing awnings on the remaining windows on 205 N. Main Street. The existing awnings are located at Heartland Bank. The new awnings will be dark green identical to the awnings already in place.

Mr. Woolard stated this petition is for a non-historic building in the downtown historic area. The grant criteria appear to give priority to historic buildings; however the awnings are specifically mentioned in regard to the improvement of the unadorned facades. Mr. Kennedy asked the difference between the options A and B. Ms. Varney stated the proposals submitted were based on the larger deposit. The Commission discussed the merits of approving the grant for a non-historic building. Mr. Woolard stated the six grant priorities as set in the year

2009 are: 1.Preserving a historic building, 2.Restoring a historic property, 3.Preserve non-historic property, 4.Restoring a non-historic property, 5.Maintenance of a historic property, 6.Maintenance of a non-historic property. That criterion does recognize the non-historic property as being a part of the consideration.

Mr. Westerhout was asked of Ms. Varney with which category does this work fall under the criteria. She stated the awnings would protect the building and add to the aesthetics of this unadorned building. Discussion surrounded the awnings. Mr. Westerhout emphasized this is not a historic preservation project and may fall into the lowest of priorities category of the listed six priorities noted earlier.

Chairman Durham stated that past commissions granted payments toward many downtown awning projects. The commission has approved awnings as part of a complete restoration project however, not on a building of this age. Mr. Kennedy proposed that since the awnings are of an aesthetic nature and not critical to a building preservation project that a contingency be placed on this application. If the money is available at the end of this fiscal year, then the grant would be considered for awnings at that time. Mr. Kennedy stressed the importance of saving said moneys this early in the fiscal year for buildings that would fall under the higher grant priority list. He stated such efforts are to restore a life of a historic building, tuck pointing or roofing. The TIF money and a definition of historic preservation were discussed. Mr. Westerhout asked if awnings were ever approved for a building of this age. Chairman Durham clarified that all of the awnings approved in his time were to older buildings and not a building of this age. Ms. Graehling and Mr. Kennedy clarified that awnings were a part of an overall east and south side restoration of the building façade. Much discussion surrounded the public use of the awnings especially if people needed shelter from rain or sun.

After due consideration, Mr. Williams moved to accept BHP-17-13 Rust Facade Grant. The motion was seconded by Mr. Elterich, which passed by a vote of 4-3. The vote record: Mr. Williams-Yes, Mr. Durham-Yes, Mr. Elterich-Yes, Mr. Greene-Yes Mr. Kennedy-No, Ms. Graehling-No, Mr. Westerhout-No

**Case BHP-18-13.** Review of application submitted by David C. Wochner, requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the a new concrete driveway which serves the Isaac Funk House, Georgian Revival, 1869-1871, located at 815 N. Prairie Street in the Franklin Square National Register Historic District.

Chairman Durham introduced the case. Mr. Castranova from Old Time Masonry explained the project is replacing concrete with concrete. Mr. Kennedy has observed the concrete to be non-repairable. There was a discussion regarding curb areas, grading, drainage, driveway length and width. Currently the driveway will be approximately one and a half foot wider than the current width. Mr. Castranova mentioned that many layers of gravel and brick seem to have been covered by dirt and grass so it's hard to say how wide the original driveway measure was. Much discussion ensued regarding approach width and following the architecture guide for replacing the cement with the same 'footprint' and not allowing a width expansion. Chairman Durham clarified that there is going to be an approval of a like for like replacement of the driveway. There has been no permission from this commission to allow for a wider drives or approaches. The discussion on widths included the standard typical one lane roadway at 55 mph is 12', a typical parking space is 9' wide and a typical single drive into a new built home today is 10'.

After due consideration, Ms. Graehling made a motion to approve the width of the driveway to be determined by the width of the approach area that flares out from the sidewalk in front so that the distance between whichever distance that is laid up against the sidewalk would be the allowed width of the driveway. The motion was seconded by Mr. Greene, which passed by a vote of 6-1.

The vote record: Mr. Williams-Yes, Mr. Durham-No, Mr. Elterich-Yes, Mr. Greene-Yes Mr. Kennedy-Yes, Ms. Graehling-Yes, Mr. Westerhout-Yes

**Case BHP-19-13.** Review of application submitted by Phi Mu Alpha Sintonia Fraternity, requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the a new concrete driveway which serves the Dr. Mammen House, Queen

Anne style, 1897-1898, Arthur L. Pillsbury, located at 303 E. Chestnut Street in the Franklin Square National Register Historic District.

Chairman Durham introduced the case and invited anyone who is present to speak. Mr. Castranova remained present for this discussion as well. Mr. Kennedy referred to paragraph 6c and he is assuming that it is on the Phi Mu Alpha side of the house. If you look at that driveway today, the curb is on Walkner side and it's a good six inches higher than what the existing surface of the driveway. On the Phi Mu Alpha side of the driveway there is a curb there. You can look and see that it was there, but basically level with the driving surface. So if that driveway is brought up six inches in height, then it will look odd without fill. Mr. Castranova stated that fill and seed are listed in the contract for that area.

Chairman Durham discussed the definition of the size of the apron as there was no measure presented by Mr. Castranova. He suggested that if the apron is wider and no more than 10 feet wide, then the extent of the drive should match the apron, but the drive cannot be larger than 10 feet. Mr. Williams stated that the drive should be centered with the apron. Mr. Castranova stated that he could flare to meet the drive.

Mr. Williams made a motion to approve BHP-19-13 with the stipulation that driveway be no wider than 10 feet centered on the approach coming from the street. The motion was seconded by Mr. Kennedy, which passed by a vote of 7-0. Mr. Williams-Yes, Mr. Durham-Yes, Mr. Elterich-Yes, Mr. Greene-Yes Mr. Kennedy-Yes, Ms. Graehling-Yes, Mr. Westerhout-Yes

Mr. Kennedy made a motion to revise BHP-18-13 to read identical to BHP-19-13. The motion was seconded by Ms. Graehling, which passed by a vote of 7-0.

The vote record: Mr. Williams-Yes, Mr. Durham-Yes, Mr. Elterich-Yes, Mr. Greene-Yes Mr. Kennedy-Yes, Ms. Graehling-Yes, Mr. Westerhout-Yes

Mr. Kennedy suggested that if we do not have property measures from the petitioner that the commission does not precede with the discussion and approval process until exact measures are presented. He shared his own experience and the need for exact measures.

**Case BHP-20-13.** Review of application submitted by Kimberly Jackson requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for siding work for the William Meyers House, Queen Anne Style, c. 1895, located at 406 E. Walnut Street in the Franklin Square National Register Historic District.

Chairman Durham introduced the case and Ms. Jackson presented the case for need replacing some of the wood shake due to water draining improperly. Ms. Jackson stated that shake will be same color replacement. Mr. Kennedy inquired about the estimate that included misc. boards to the back of the house. Ms. Jackson explained that she will keep like kind replacement. Much discussion ensued about the types of replacement materials. Ms. Jackson welcomed the articulation of materials in the motion. Mr. Williams specified the best materials for this type and time period wood work.

After due consideration, Mr. Kennedy moved to approve case BHP-20-13 the Certificate of Appropriateness for the painting and the repair work to 406 E. Walnut with the adjustments that instead of cedar shake it is actually cedar shingle specifying use of number one grade western cedar blue label and the miscellaneous boards on the back of home and the band board on the circular section be done in cedar as well. The motion was seconded by Mr. Westerhout, which passed by a vote of 7-0.

The vote record: Mr. Williams-Yes, Mr. Durham-Yes, Mr. Elterich-Yes, Mr. Greene-Yes Mr. Kennedy-Yes, Ms. Graehling-Yes, Mr. Westerhout-Yes

Case BHP-21-13. Review of application submitted by Kimberly Jackson requesting an up to \$1,737.00 Eugene D. Funk, Jr. Historic Preservation Grant for siding work for the William Meyers House, Queen Anne Style, c. 1895, located at 406 E. Walnut Street in the Franklin Square National Register Historic District.

Chairman Durham introduced the case and suggested that since there is a change in a higher grade of materials, that the total requested amount be revised. Mr. Kennedy clarified that touch up painting on the current estimate would not be eligible for the grant moneys. There was some disconnect between the presented estimate which listed painting in areas other than the location of repairs and the painting of the wood that is to be replaced. The grant does stipulate that if the entire exterior home is going to be painted, then a grant can be considered only once every ten years.

Chairman Durham clarified that since there has been a certificate of appropriateness granted, the stipulated work can begin without the amount approval as requested in BHP-21-13. Mr. Kennedy articulated the need for not only the itemized bill of completed work, but the need for before, during and after photos. That way the commission can make sure that the workmanship and materials meet the standards. The photos help with accountability when spending taxpayers' money. Ms. Graehling advised that part of this commission's responsibility is to educate homeowners.

After due consideration, Chairman Durham stated that there will be a layover on this case. The commission encouraged Ms. Jackson to resubmit a revised detailed estimate before consideration of approval.

Ms. Graehling moved to lay over case BHP-21-13 pending further detailed information including the final cost of the work. There was a second by Mr. Williams which was approved 7-0.

The vote record: Mr. Williams-Yes, Mr. Durham-Yes, Mr. Elterich-Yes, Mr. Greene-Yes

Mr. Kennedy-Yes, Ms. Graehling-Yes, Mr. Westerhout-Yes

#### **OLD BUSINESS:** None

Chairman Durham thanked the special sub-committee who reviewed the 115 E. Monroe Street stone materials.

A discussion ensued about the need for petitioners to provide clarity and details for the commission to make a knowledgeable decision.

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

### **Report of Historic Preservation Activities:**

Mr. Woolard stated that there is a list of commission reference materials coming for each member to review and for their preference of a printed or an electronic version.

## **Any Other New Business that May Arise: None**

Ms. Graehling made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Williams seconded the motion which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 6:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Mark Woolard City Planner

#### For further information contact:

Mark Woolard, City Planner
Department of Planning and Code Enforcement
115 E. Washington Street
Bloomington, IL 61701
Phone (309) 434-2341 Fax (309) 434-2857

E-mail: mwoolard@cityblm.org