

MINUTES
BLOOMINGTON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING,
THURSDAY, MAY 18, 2017 5:00 P.M.
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
109 EAST OLIVE ST.
BLOOMINGTON, ILLINOIS

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairperson Sherry Graehling, Mr. Levi Sturgeon, Ms. Lea Cline, Mr. Gabe Goldsmith

MEMBERS ABSENT: Mr. John Elterich, Ms. Ann Bailen

OTHERS PRESENT: Ms. Katie Simpson, City Planner; Mr. Tom Dabareiner, AICP, Community Development Director; Mr. Jim Karch, Public Works Director; Mr. Michael Hill, Miscellaneous Technician in Public Works Administration

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Graehling called the meeting to order at 5:05 P.M.

ROLL CALL: Ms. Simpson called the roll and with four members present there was a quorum.

PUBLIC COMMENT: No public comment.

MINUTES: The Commission reviewed the minutes of the April 20, 2017 meeting. Ms. Cline corrected a scrivener's error on page 3. Mr. Sturgeon made a motion to approve the minutes as corrected; seconded by Ms. Cline. The motion was approved by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Goldsmith—yes; Chairperson Graehling—yes.

REGULAR AGENDA:

BHP-03-17 Consideration, review and approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for repairing the rotted bases of existing columns and replacing rotten rails and spindles of the front porch at 606 E. Grove Street, Charleston Stevenson House; late Victorian Style, c. 1903, East Grove Historic District (NC).

BHP-04-17 Consideration, review and approval of a Funk Grant for \$2725.00 for repairing the rotted bases of existing columns and replacing rotten rails and spindles of the front porch at 606 E. Grove Street, Charleston Stevenson House; late Victorian Style, c. 1903, East Grove Historic District (NC).

Chairperson Graehling introduced cases BHP-03-17 and BHP-04-17. Ms. Simpson presented the staff report and explained staff is recommending in favor of the Certificate of Appropriateness and the Funk Grant request of \$2725.00. Ms. Simpson described the zoning. She mentioned that at the time of the original East Grove District Survey this home was considered noncontributing however, since then the home has regained historic importance. Ms. Simpson provided a brief

overview of the restoration efforts conducted by the current homeowners. Ms. Simpson described the scope of work presented in the Certificate of Appropriateness and grant applications. She explained staff determined the Secretary of the Interior's Standards to be met. She stated that staff would like to see the final porch primed and painted or finished since it is visible from the street.

Terri Clemons, the petitioner, 606 E. Grove St, stated that when she bought the home the porch was enclosed. She explained that she has since removed the porch and discovered the railings which were constructed of indoor wood. She explained a woman who lived at the home presented pictures of the house from 1950 that show the original porch and they have found spindles that match the original. Mr. Sturgeon asked if Ms. Clemons intends to keep the decorative eye. Ms. Clemons explained that they do not intend to keep that feature. Chairperson Graehling and Mr. Sturgeon agreed the decorative eye was not a necessary feature to keep. Chairperson Graehling applauded Ms. Clemons on her contributions to historic preservation and the restoration of this home.

Ms. Cline motioned to approve case BHP-03-17, a Certificate of Appropriateness for porch repairs at 606 E. Grove St.; seconded by Mr. Goldsmith. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Goldsmith—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Chairperson Graehling—yes.

Ms. Cline motioned to approve case BHP-04-17, a Funk Grant in the amount of \$2,725.00 for porch repairs; seconded by Mr. Sturgeon. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Goldsmith—yes; Chairperson Graehling—yes.

BHP-05-17 Consideration, review and approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the roof and tuck-pointing the chimney at 905 N. McLean Street, Frank Baker House, Queen Anne Style with Georgian Revival Influence; c. 1894, Franklin Square Historic District.

Chairperson Graehling introduced case BHP-05-17. Ms. Simpson presented the staff report and explained staff is recommending in favor of the Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Simpson described the home and the Franklin Park Historic District. She explained the home has a slate roof but the homeowner stated that they are unable to afford the maintenance required of a slate roof. She stated the homeowner is requesting to remove the slate roof and replace it with asphalt shingles that resemble slate. Ms. Simpson stated that, according to the application, the petitioner intends to keep the slate roofing on the turret. Ms. Simpson stated the City of Bloomington's Architectural review guidelines identify asphalt shingles as an acceptable replacement material for slate. She described the proposed shingles would be gray and the petitioner is trying to maintain a similar appearance to the original roof, in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Ms. Cline motioned to approve case BHP-05-17 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a roof at 905 N. McLean Street; seconded by Mr. Sturgeon. The motion was **approved** by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Mr. Goldsmith—yes; Chairperson Graehling—yes.

BHP-06-17 Consideration, review and approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the roof with asphalt shingles that resemble the original wooden shingles at 1011 E. Jefferson Street, Charles E Perry House; front-gable type c. 1880's, Davis Jefferson Historic District.

BHP-07-17 Consideration, review and approval of a Funk Grant for \$5,000.00 for replacing the roof with asphalt shingles that resemble the original wooden shingles at 1011 E. Jefferson Street, Charles E Perry House; front-gable type c. 1880's, Davis Jefferson Historic District.

Chairperson Graehling introduced case BHP-06-17 and BHP-07-17. John Wyssman, the Petitioner, 1011 E. Jefferson Street described the current state of the roof. He stated the roofer completing the project recently finished a roof on another house in the district. He explained they are hoping to replace the roof on both the home and garage. He stated the home was built in 1885 and 1886.

Ms. Simpson presented the staff report. She stated staff is recommending in favor of the Certificate of Appropriateness and the grant amount of \$5,000 to cover the cost of repairs on the home. Ms. Simpson described the home and stated the Architectural Review Guidelines allow asphalt shingles as an appropriate replacement for a wooden roof but disallow wood shake shingles and heavy asphalt shingles giving that appearance. She stated the petitioner submitted sample materials which were passed around to the board for review.

Ms. Cline stated she has no question of the Certificate of Appropriateness and asked if the Funk Grant could be used for asphalt roofing. Ms. Simpson stated the grant guidelines allow the grant funds to cover modern roofing materials that are mimicking historic materials in appearance and durability and usability of the roof. Ms. Cline asked if the petitioner could use smooth, round gutters and rounded out downspouts which are more architecturally appropriate for the home.

Mr. Sturgeon asked if the commission has historical precedent for approving asphalt shingles. Ms. Simpson stated that this would be the first case she has seen, but that the commission had a grant specifically for asphalt shingles at one point. Mr. Sturgeon asked Mr. Wyssman about the timeline of his project. He stated he hoped to begin sometime this summer. Ms. Cline asked if Mr. Wyssman would be able to provide additional information regarding the durability and price difference of the proposed shingles from regular shingles and if rounded gutters are available. Chairperson Graehling asked if the product he is proposing will extend the longevity of the roof.

Mr. Wyssman stated he would research the additional information requested by the commission. Mr. Sturgeon asked staff to review past cases and determine the last time asphalt shingles were funded through the Funk Grant by the commission.

Mr. Sturgeon motioned to table cases BHP-06-17 and BHP-07-17 until the petitioner is able to return with additional information about the longevity, durability and costs of the roof and the availability of round gutters and downspouts; seconded by Ms. Cline. The motion was approved by a vote of 4-0 with the following votes cast in favor on roll call: Mr. Sturgeon—yes; Ms. Cline—yes; Mr. Goldsmith—yes; Chairperson Graehling—yes.

Mr. Wyssman commented that he appreciated having a brick street in his neighborhood and stated it is important to the character of the neighborhood. He stated it has lasted a long time.

OLD BUSINESS:

Presentation, discussion and review on the City of Bloomington's Brick Streets Master Plan, 2009. Presentation by Jim Karch, Director of Public Works.

Chairperson Graehling introduced Jim Karch, Director of Public Works. Mr. Karch stated that the intention of the presentation is to receive feedback from the commission about next steps for the Brick Street Plan. He provided background on his experience as a civil engineer and director with public works. He explained the previous Brick Street Plan process including public hearings held before the Historic Preservation Commission. He stated the goal of the original plan was to prioritize the maintenance and preservation of the 3.5 miles of brick streets in Bloomington. He explained there are many pieces of the plan he would like to revisit. He presented a brief history of brick streets in Bloomington. He stated the city inventoried the bricks that have been removed but the city is having difficulty protecting their stockpile of bricks. Mr. Karch explained additional challenges faced by the city including finding contractors experienced in brick street preservation and updating the methodology and criteria used in the 2009 plan.

Mr. Karch asked the commissioners to drive the brick streets and provide feedback on the conditions and quality of the streets. Mr. Karch stated the three classifications in the original plan: restore, repair and reconstruct, should be updated. He stated he hopes city council will be able to allocate \$500,000 annually for maintenance and repair. He stated he would like the commission to prioritize the streets. Mr. Karch explained the timeline for the plan. He stated Public Works would like feedback from the Commission on the following issues: historic brick vs modern pavers; preservation of all streets vs resurfacing streets in poor condition; guidance regarding historic curbs and ADA compliance; designated no-truck routes on brick streets; other neighborhood components that should be included; tying the brick streets plan with the comprehensive plan and other plans; lifecycle costs of brick streets; and, funding mechanisms.

Mr. Sturgeon thanked Mr. Karch for the presentation. He asked about brick streets which have been covered with asphalt. Mr. Karch stated that the Public Works Department will implement a pilot project removing the asphalt on Grove Street to reveal the brick streets. Ms. Cline asked if Mr. Karch was able to research bulk pricing of brick maintenance. Mr. Karch stated that buying in bulk can reduce costs from \$250/sqyd to \$160/sqyd and a firm in Oswego could provide a maintenance contract. He stated we need to research the success of new pavers. Ms. Cline stated we are in an opportune position because other cities are also restoring their brick streets and can provide a resource for the city. Ms. Cline asked about a hole in Summit Street, a brick street and the level of damage that could happen. Mr. Karch stated the residents living on brick streets will have to be diligent and report these items to staff. Ms. Cline stated there is a lack of brick streets on the west side and she is concerned about a temporary patch on the brick streets. She stated it is important to see if we can patch this area with bricks instead of gravel. Mr. Karch stated that if there is additional funding available he would be interested in pursuing a maintenance contract to repair the hole. Mr. Karch stated he is also interested in feedback from the commission on new brick streets such as in front of the David Davis Mansion or in the downtown. He would like the Master Plan to address this.

There was discussion on the past experiences trying to preserve the street in front of David Davis Mansion and in the Jefferson District. Ms. Cline asked for clarification about the Commission's role in the development of the plan. There was discussion about gathering input from

stakeholders. Ms. Cline stated she is interested in guidance on rating and prioritizing streets. Mr. Karch suggested the historic neighborhoods should be a priority.

Ms. Terri Vice Williams, 613 E. Grove, stated she thinks a survey distributed door-to-door would be helpful and that she would be willing to help distribute a survey. She stated that even renters are interested in preserving the streets. She explained she feels repairing and preserving the brick streets we have are more important than creating new brick streets. Ms. Cline states she thinks creating brick streets whether in the historic areas or downtown could incentivize people to participate in the preservation of our brick streets. Mr. Dabareiner explained that the Comprehensive Plan established a commitment to brick streets; he stated we have the direction to preserve the streets but we have to be mindful of the staff time analyzing information. He stated this is a great opportunity for the commission to give recommendations. He stated we will publish the meetings and we can mail notices to neighbors. Mr. Karch briefly described the PASER rating system.

Ms. Cline stated she feels the commission should begin by reevaluating the assumptions on page 8. She would like public comment as the commission rewrites them. Mr. Karch proposed returning to the list of assumptions at the next meeting and reevaluating them. Chairperson Graehling requested staff provide best practices regarding assumptions. Mr. Karch stated staff is working on providing an updated draft but this is a work-in-progress. He stated staff intends to send out updates as they go.

NEW BUSINESS:

None.

ADJOURNMENT: Mr. Sturgeon made a motion to adjourn; Ms. Cline seconded the motion, which passed unanimously by voice vote. The meeting was adjourned at 6:25 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Katie Simpson, City Planner
Secretary